Centering Racial Equity in Data Use

#LiveAtUrban
Housekeeping

- Event is being recorded and the recording will be posted online afterward.
- The slides are available online.
- All participants are muted.
- Type your questions or comments into the Q&A box at any time.
Centering Racial Equity in Data Use

Sue Gallagher, Children’s Service Council of Broward County

#LiveAtUrban
Shared Communities &
Shared Commitment to Equitable Data Systems & Use
While the number of juvenile arrests has decreased significantly for Black, White, & Hispanic youth, the disproportionality between Blacks & Whites increased since SFY 2005/06. The disparity has started to decrease slightly in SFY 17/18 & 18/19 but is still higher than in previous years. (FDJJ)
## Structure of Racism in the US

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Bacon’s Rebellion</strong></th>
<th><strong>Civil War</strong></th>
<th><strong>Civil Rights</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1674</td>
<td>1864</td>
<td>1964</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Slave Codes</td>
<td>• Black Codes (Jim Crow)</td>
<td>• Race Neutral Policies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Violence to maintain racial hierarchy</td>
<td>• Violence to maintain racial hierarchy</td>
<td>• Violence to maintain racial hierarchy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Message – Blacks are not human</td>
<td>• Message – Blacks should be separate</td>
<td>• Message – Black behavior is wrong</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Protests &amp; Resistance</td>
<td>• Protests &amp; Resistance</td>
<td>• Protests &amp; Resistance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ibram Kendi (2016) Stamped from the Beginning: The Definitive History of Racist Ideas in America
White Rage: The Unspoken Truth of Our Racial Divide
HISTORY OF SEGREGATION & RESISTANCE IN FORT LAUDERDALE
(extracted from My Soul is a Witness: A History of Black Fort Lauderdale by Deborah Work)

1920s
• White leaders decided it was bad business to mingle the races.
• White tourists did not want to see Blacks except as help.
• Use of Eminent Domain - many Black families forced to sell houses East of US 1 for less than the value
• 1922
  • Dr. James Sistrunk - Black Physician arrived
  • Planning officials created city grid that solidified segregation
  • City officials restricted where black families could live and set curfews at 8 pm needed permission from White people
  • Jim Crow practices in effect: black & white entrances, hotels and restaurants to beaches.
  • Black Beach available use library, hospital, Black & white entrances, Black children only allowed to go to school 3 months of year once Black only school built in 1924

1930s
• Dillard School went up to 10th grade but had no funding for supplies.
• Black students had to walk from Oakland Park & Dania to get to school because buses were only for White children
• Black neighborhoods had no sidewalks and limited sanitation services
• Violence by whites against blacks was commonplace in the 30s including hangings, shooting, cutting to death.
• Attempt to organize Ft. Lauderdale’s Black businessmen failed because there was not enough Black capital.
• 1937
  • Dr. Von D. Mizell arrived
  • James L. Bass 1st Black dentist arrived
  • Ft. Lauderdale’s 1st public housing project build

1940s
• Dr. Mizell requested Library, park, and beach access, sanitary sewerage system, increase police protection; not granted until the 1960s
• 1940
  • Segregated Hospital was created (Provident) - Black doctors were not allowed to do surgery in White hospitals and Blacks could not receive treatment in White hospitals
  • 1941
    • 1st year black children get 9 months of school-whites fought it wanted them to work in the fields
  • 1945
    • Dr. Von Mizell and Eula Johnson founded the Ft. Lauderdale NAACP to fight against police practice of arresting black people at random and making them work in the fields when they could not pay fines.
• 1946
  • Federal Government mandated Blacks receive poorer service in White hospital, Black doctors not allowed to work in White hospital, Black doctors lost jobs
• 1947
  • First 2 Black cops were hired

1950s & 1960s
• 1950s Sit ins due to no access to restaurants, libraries, and beaches.
• 1960 – Alcee Hastings sued hotels and restaurants to integrate
• 1961
  • Voting barriers were in place for Blacks
• 1963
  • Blacks had the legal right to swim anywhere, yet it took years to integrate, not allowed in restaurants or hotels
• 1964
  • Integration of hospitals was mandated - Blacks received poorer service in White hospital, Black doctors not allowed to work in White hospital, Black doctors lost jobs
• 1965
  • Confederate flag in Fort Lauderdale flown at a protest of Blacks for poor prison conditions.
• 1966
  • NAACP protested “colored men & women signs” at Fort Lauderdale middle school
• 1969
  • Fort Lauderdale Riot

1960s & 1970s
• Civil rights movement prevalent in Ft. Lauderdale
• School desegregation continues
• KKK maintained a strong presence & responded violently to freedom rides, sit-ins, & mass demonstrations
• 1973
  • Andrew DeGrafenreidt elected 1st black City Commissioner.
• 1972
  • Thomas J. Reddick appointed 1st black Circuit Court Judge.
• 1974
  • K.C. W. (Kathleen C. Wright), first Black female, elected to the school board
• 1970s - residential segregation increases as middle-class whites abandoned urban residential areas for new developments in suburbs.

1980’s-2015
• Florida & Nation
  • War on drugs-Sentencing for Blacks results in significant disparity in prison population
  • McDuffie Riots in Miami when police were acquitted of murdering an insurance salesman, Arthur McDuffie
  • Racial profiling
  • Racial wealth gap due to redlining into segregated spaces through 1960s legally (still happening today)
  • Predatory lending disproportionately affected people of color
  • People of color disproportionately live in concentrated pockets of poverty
  • 20% of African-American voters in Florida are disenfranchised (i.e., felon)
  • 2005 US Senate apologizes for not passing anti-lynching Bill
  • Harvard report on school segregation showing that 70% of African American students are in segregated schools (2000)
  • Community of Promise
  • Grassroots Partnerships
  • Broward Municipal Services District Work Plan
  • Other

Other developments in residential areas for new developments in suburbs.
Structure of Racism in Data Systems & Use

Racialized Hierarchy

Social & Spatial Segregation

Justifying Narrative
Design of Anti-Racist Data Systems

Racialized Hierarchy

Social & Spatial Segregation

Justifying Narrative

Equitable Funding
Shared Decision Making

Non-Data/Non-Service Relationships

Humanizing Stories
Focus on Policy/System
Community Participatory Action Research

Child Welfare

Juvenile Justice

Behavioral Health

Note: Image from Free Child Institute
Principles to Advance Equitable Data Practice

Leah Hendey, Urban Institute
Elevate Data for Equity

https://www.urban.org/elevate-data-equity

Elevate Data for Equity

Improve community health. Advance economic mobility. Reduce persistent poverty. Communities across the country are tackling ambitious goals like these, and data can be a powerful tool in their fight.

But not everyone has access to data or the skills and resources to use those data to advocate for change. In particular, marginalized communities, including people of color and those with low incomes, are often shut out of opportunities to access data or have been harmed by others who are using data irresponsibly.

Through this project, we aim to help philanthropy, researchers, nonprofits, and local governments invest in data capacity and make data practices more equitable.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Foundations</th>
<th>Data Analysts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Invest in Data Capacity</td>
<td>Develop Equitable Data Practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A community with data capacity is one where people can access and use data to understand and improve outcomes where they live. Foundations have the resources and influence to help remedy the shortage and the unequal distribution of local data capacity and to enhance a community's ability to achieve change. Foundations can promote, champion, and invest in the data capacity of their grantees and of the community more broadly. Doing so will better equip communities to use data to understand issues.</td>
<td>Data are not neutral—they are shaped by people's decisions about which data matter, how they are collected, and how they are analyzed and shared. And data have been used against people of color and other marginalized communities, from historical redlining practices to modern biases in hiring algorithms. Even when data aren't used to intentionally harm, they are often created and analyzed without input from the people at the heart of the issues being studied. With a critical lens, analysts can evaluate their data practices.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Data are not neutral
Principles are needed to protect people and communities
Principles for Equitable Data Practice

- **Beneficence** – maximize benefits and avoid causing harm
- **Respect for persons** – uphold people’s power to make decisions in their interest and protect those without power
- **Justice** – fair distribution of burdens and benefits among people
Stages of the Data Life Cycle

- Acquisition
- Processing/analysis
- Dissemination
- Disposition

Aggregate- and Individual-Level Data

- Administrative
- Surveys
- Focus groups
- Interviews
Data Dissemination in Milwaukee’s Amani Neighborhood
Everyone has a duty to use and manage data responsibly and ethically

- Organization and agency leaders
- Data stewards and managers
- Researchers and analysts
- Data users
Reference Links

• Principles for Equitable Data Practice
  • https://urbn.is/3dET7if

• Resource List for Equitable Data Practice
  • https://urbn.is/3kvoPm7
Centering Racial Equity in Data Use

Bridget Blount, Baltimore’s Progress

#LiveAtUrban

Process

- Expressed need from sites
- Learning from Broward County, FL

2017

Initial funding from AECF
Began to put together workgroup

2018

Funding from Sloan and DFC
In person workgroup meetings in July and October

2019

Finalizing site-based contributors
Writing, editing, and review
Sharing and dissemination

2020

Document shifts in site-based practices
Learn and share and shift

2021

Document shifts in site-based practices
Learn and share and shift
The Current Moment is Complicated.

Governments have more capacity than ever before to share and use longitudinal administrative data for analytics and decision-making.

This represents an improvement on:
- Hunches
- Doing what we’ve always done just because
- Limited surveys/small sampling

But administrative data and analytic tools are not:
- Reflective of lived experience
- Historically contextualized
- Good at distinguishing correlation vs. causation
- A measurement of what matters most

Thank you to Michelle Shevin for permission to reuse the content of this slide.
As railroads and highways both developed and decimated communities, so too can data infrastructure.

We can co-create data infrastructure to promote racial equity and the public good, or we can invest in data infrastructure that disregards the historical, social, and political context.
Where do we need to center racial equity?
Where do we need to center racial equity?
WE STRONGLY ENCOURAGE:

- Inclusive participatory governance around data access and use
- Social license for data access and use
- A developmental approach to data sharing and integration—start small and grow

WE DISCOURAGE:

- Broad access to individual-level linked data
- Data use for enforcement or investigation actions against residents
- Use of predictive algorithms without determining responsibility, explainability, accuracy, auditability, and fairness*
- Use of linked data across institutions that have patterns of institutional racism, specifically, law enforcement, which has demonstrated significant racialized harm without sufficient safeguards in place

A Toolkit for Centering Racial Equity Throughout Data Integration

#CenterRacialEquity

*https://www.fatml.org/resources/principles-for-accountable-algorithms
Benefit/Risk Matrix

- Mapping indicators to allocate new investments to high-need neighborhoods
- Program evaluation with longitudinal outcomes
- Unduplicated counts of children across early childhood program

- Linking individual data on wages & earnings
- Case management algorithms
- Using "risk scores" to target interventions

- Open data initiatives that publish aggregate data sets

- Predictive analytics in policing
- Tracking social media on students
- Linking biometric data (e.g., facial recognition)
**Data Classification Matrix**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OPEN DATA</th>
<th>RESTRICTED DATA</th>
<th>UNAVAILABLE DATA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Data that can be shared openly, either at the aggregate or individual level, based on state and federal law. These data often exist in open data portals.</td>
<td>Data that can be shared, but only under specific circumstances with appropriate safeguards in place.</td>
<td>Data that cannot or should not be shared, either because of state or federal law, lack of digital format (paper copies only), or data quality or other concerns.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Data can be shared with agreement and approval through governance**

**Open data; can be shared without an agreement**

**Not shareable**

**Technology and/or data structure limits ability to share data**
### Racial Equity in Planning: Positive & Problematic Practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>POSITIVE PRACTICE</th>
<th>PROBLEMATIC PRACTICE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Including diverse perspectives (such as community members with lived experiences and agency staff who understand the data) on planning committees</td>
<td>Using only token “representation” in agenda-setting, question creation, governance, or IRB review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building capacity for researchers, administrators, and community participants to work together on agenda-setting</td>
<td>Using deadlines or grant deliverables as an excuse to rush or avoid authentic community engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researching, understanding, and disseminating the history of local policies, systems, and structures involved, including past harms and future opportunities</td>
<td>Using only historical administrative data to describe the problem, without a clear plan of action to improve outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building data literacy among organizations and community members, which could range from light engagement through public activities like data “gallery walks” to more intense involvement, such as community-based participatory action research</td>
<td>Failing to manage expectations around what the data are capable of telling or how long it will take to see marked changes in data, actions, and outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establishing a common language and agreed upon sources and methods for reporting on community-based indicators</td>
<td>Failing to revisit indicator and outcome metrics regularly and revise when necessary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clearly discerning who decides how to frame the problem or determine what questions to ask</td>
<td>Relying on academic institutions to frame the problem and research questions while failing to engage community-based organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning that includes the use of an asset: creating a framework that aims to clarify how to improve policy, services, and outcomes</td>
<td>Planning that includes the use of a deficit: creating a framework to describe outcomes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifting up the research needs of community to funders: helping shape funding strategy with funders to support community-driven research</td>
<td>Accepting grant/philanthropic funding for a project that is not a community priority or need</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Racial Equity in Planning: WORK IN ACTION

Broward Data Collaborative by Sue Gallagher

Created in 2017, the Broward Data Collaborative (BDC) seeks to improve the outcome of data integration from multiple sources to inform evaluation, research, and policy. The BDC consists of Broward County Public Schools, Broward County Human Services, Broward Behavioral Health Coalition, Florida Department of Children and Family, Early Learning Coalition of Broward, and the Children’s Services Council of Broward County (which acts as the BDC backbone organization). In planning the BDC, the Council of Broward County used a Community Participatory Action Research (PAR) model to operationalize their core values of equity and transparency and account for the structural racism perpetuated by the community’s systems and organizations. The BDC’s recognition that their county-level systems produce racially disparate outcomes has guided their work to begin building nonhierarchical relationships between the community and professionals.

The BDC is creating an integrated data system that allows them to share strength across their community and community members and use data to co-create system and policy improvements.

The Broward Data Collaborative has worked to provide a seat at the proverbial and the table for residents whose data is represented in the child-serving integrated data system (BCC). The BDC’s recognition that their county-level systems produce racially disparate outcomes has guided their work to begin building nonhierarchical relationships between the community and professionals. The BDC seeks to improve the outcomes of residents in Broward County by integrating child-serving data from child welfare, behavioral health, juvenile justice, schools, early learning centers, human services, and prevention programs. Data used for the BDC includes evaluation, research, and care coordination. The Children’s Services Council of Broward County, the BDC’s backbone organization, is an independent special taxing district that funds prevention programs for children and families in Broward County and has led the Broward Children’s Strategic Plan for 20 years. Currently, the BDC’s partners include senior leadership, researchers, and technologists from the human services agencies providing data to the BDC.

The BDC has repositioned a race-neutral or colorblind decision-making process by applying the PAR framework that accounts for the intersectional and structural racism within the data. The BDC is collaborating with partners to ensure that data are used to inform policy decisions, resulting in a more equitable distribution of resources and services. Through these efforts, the BDC is working towards creating a more just and equitable system for all residents of Broward County.
# Toolkit Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ORGANIZATIONAL</th>
<th>OVERALL</th>
<th>RELATIONSHIP-SPECIFIC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mission/vision, values, goals of the organization overall and in the context of the relationship.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MISSION/VISION</strong></td>
<td>What is the overall mission/vision of the organization?</td>
<td>Is there a specific mission/vision for the relationship/project?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>VALUES</strong></td>
<td>What values structure the work of the organization?</td>
<td>How do these values manifest in this project?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GOALS</strong></td>
<td>What are the stated and implied goals of the organization?</td>
<td>What are the goals specific to this relationship?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Diagram](image-url)
Biggest Takeaway?

Whether you’re a data owner, a data steward, a data custodian, a caseworker — no matter where you are, there is something you can do, today, to center racial equity.
"We are working to create a new kind of data infrastructure - one that dismantles 'feedback loops of injustice'* and instead shares power and knowledge with those who need systems change the most.

Will you join us?"

-The authors of A Toolkit for Centering Racial Equity Throughout Data Integration

#CenterRacialEquity

*Eubanks, V. (2018)
Recommended Reading

A Toolkit for Centering Racial Equity Throughout Data Integration

Next Steps

• Support sites in shift practices. Implement dissemination strategy, including workgroup participants presenting at national/international conferences

• Begin thinking about the update, as practices are growing and changing rapidly
Presenters’ Contact Information

Sue Gallagher
Chief Innovation Officer
Children’s Council of Broward County
sgallagher@cscbroward.org

Leah Hendey
Principal Research Associate, Urban Institute
Codirector, National Neighborhood Indicators Partnership
nnip@urban.org

Bridget Blount
Senior Director of Data Initiatives
Baltimore’s Promise
bridget@baltimorespromise.org
Centering Racial Equity in Data Use

#LiveAtUrban
Centering Racial Equity in Data Use

#LiveAtUrban